THE EFFECTIVENESS OF BIOSORPTION ACTIVATED MEDIA (BAM) TO REDUCE NITRATE AND ORTHOPHOSPHATE IN STORMWATER RUNOFF PART 2: Science, Engineering and Application

Marty Wanielista, 2013 A summary of published data primarily from O'Reilly, A.





OVERVIEW

- 3 ¹/₂ years of field data collection
- Analysis of biogeochemical cycling beneath two stormwater basins
- Design and construction using BAM
- Biogeochemical assessment of pre/post data at a retention basin using Biosorption Activated Media (BAM)
- Quantitative analysis of N budget and flux beneath a BMP retention basin using BAM

PARTNERS

- Marion County, Florida
- Florida Department of Environmental Protection
- Southwest Florida Water Management District
- St. Johns River Water Management District
- University of Central Florida
- U.S. Geological Survey
- University of Florida Soil and Water Science Department

HYPOTHESES

- Soil texture controls surface/subsurface oxygen exchange, thereby controlling biogeochemical processes and N and C cycling.
- 2. Variations in hydrologic conditions result in cyclic biogeochemical processes, switching N fate from NO_3^- leaching to reduction and gas production.
- 3. Nutrient input into groundwater from stormwater basins can be reduced by implementing an infiltration BMP using biosorption activated media (BAM) that replicates natural biogeochemical processes.
- 4. N budget and fluxes beneath stormwater basins can be quantified using a system dynamics modeling approach.

PROBLEM

- Elevated NO₃⁻ concentrations are common in Florida groundwater, especially in sensitive karst areas.
- NO₃⁻ concentrations have increased in many Florida springs since the 1950s.
- Stormwater runoff is one source of N into the ground.
- Little research is available on *biogeochemical cycling* beneath stormwater infiltration basins on which to base new management strategies.

STUDY AREA

2.0

1.5

1,0

0,5

0.0

1955

1960

YEAR

Source: Phelps (2004)

NITRATE-N, N MILLIGRAMS PER LITER

- 2 stormwater basins studied near Silver Springs (Q = $22 \text{ m}^3/\text{s}$).
- Increasing NO₃⁻ in Silver Springs.



Jacksonville

ensacola

HUNTER'S TRACE BASIN

- 2800 m² basin
- 23 ha watershed
- Water table < 3 m below basin bottom
- Residential land use





SOUTH OAK BASIN

- 1600 m² basin
- 29 ha watershed
- Water table < 1 m below basin bottom
- Residential land use





WATER QUALITY MONITORING

- Major elements
- Nutrients (nitrogen and phosphorus)
- Organic carbon
- Trace metals
- Dissolved and soil gases
- Stable oxygen and hydrogen isotopes of water; and oxygen and nitrogen isotopes of nitrate and nitrogen gas
- Soil mineralogy and chemistry
- Nitrite reductase gene density by real-time polymerase chain reaction (RT-PCR)





HYDROLOGIC MONITORING

- Rainfall
- Basin (stored stormwater) stage
- Groundwater level
- Soil moisture content
- Soil temperature
- Soil matric potential (tensiometers)
- Soil moisture retention curves





HYPOTHESIS #1

Soil texture controls surface/subsurface oxygen exchange, thereby controlling biogeochemical processes and N and C cycling.

SOILS and Moisture

- At the SO basin, fine-textured soil causes higher soil moisture content, inhibiting O₂ diffusion into the subsurface.
- At the HT basin, coarse-textured soil causes lower soil moisture content, allowing O₂ diffusion into the subsurface.
- O₂ availability is a critical control for denitrification and other biogeochemical processes.

SITE COMPARISONS

| Hunter's Trace (HT) | Parameter | South Oak (SO) |
|--------------------------|---------------------------|--------------------------|
| Deeper | Water Table | Shallower |
| Less | Silty/Clayey Soils | More |
| Lower | Cation Exchange Capacity | Higher |
| Higher | Infiltration Rate | Lower |
| Higher | Dissolved Oxygen | Lower |
| Lower | Alkalinity | Higher |
| Lower | Organic Carbon | Higher |
| Higher (median=2.2 mg/L) | Groundwater Nitrate | Lower (median=0.03 mg/L) |
| No | Nitrate Decline with Time | Yes |

SOIL CHARACTERISTICS

 Textural differences contributed to large differences in the soil moisture retention curves.



SOIL ANALYSIS – Chemistry

- CEC higher at South Oak
- Higher CEC than typical Florida soils, likely due to prevalence of clay mineral smectite





HYDROLOGIC CONDITIONS Runoff & Infiltration

- Prolonged flooding of SO basin – infiltration rate 14–29 mm/d
- Intermittent flooding of HT basin – infiltration rate 170–260 mm/d
- Comparison of CN-estimated runoff, basin volume, and stage changes indicates 17% (SO basin) and 32% (HT basin) of runoff volume reaches infiltratin basin for 155 mm storm (Tropical Storm Fay)



HYDROLOGIC CONDITIONS Soil Moisture

- Soil moisture data indicate soil stays wetter longer at the SO site compared to the HT site
- A substantial gas phase fraction is more conducive to O₂ diffusion and aerobic groundwater



GROUNDWATER QUALITY South Oak basin

- N primarily in organic form when O₂ low and NO₃⁻ form when aerobic
- Typically low O₂ or anoxic
- GW DOC ~¹/₂ of SW DOC
- CI and NO₃⁻ variations dissimilar (r² = 0.21 for well PW) suggests *reaction*-dominated N fate



GROUNDWATER QUALITY Hunter's Trace Basin

- N nearly exclusively in NO₃⁻ form
- Aerobic, DO 5–8 mg/L
- Low DOC 0.5–1.0 mg/l
- CI and NO₃⁻ variations very similar (r² = 0.64 for M-0506) suggests *advection*-dominated N fate



NITRATE SOURCES, TRANSPORT, & FATE

- δ¹⁵N and δ¹⁸O of NO₃⁻ indicate various sources: atmospheric, fertilizer, and nitrification of soil N and rain/fertilizer NH₄⁺
- At the SO basin, isotopic enrichment and excess N₂.
- At the HT basin, no isotopic enrichment and no excess N₂.



Outlines of typical nitrate source ranges from Kendall and Aravena (2000)

DENITRIFICATION SUMMARY

- The four conditions required for denitrification are:
- (1) Nitrate present (electron acceptor);
- (2) Oxygen very low or absent;
- (3) Electron donor present (typically an organic carbon compound); and
- (4) Denitrifying bacteria present.
- Conditions 2, 3, and 4 exist at the SO basin, therefore when nitrate is present denitrification occurs rapidly.
- At the HT basin, data indicate condition 2 is the critical missing condition.
- Differing oxygen levels between the two basins likely are due to soil textural characteristics. The fine-textured soil at the SO basin retains moisture, thereby substantially reducing oxygen transport into the subsurface.

SURFACE/SUBSURFACE O₂ EXCHANGE

- Photosynthesis does not occur in the subsurface, O₂ can only be replenished by diffusion of atmospheric O₂ into the subsurface or by advective transport dissolved in infiltrating water.
- Soil moisture is important because O₂ diffusion through water is 10,000 times less than through air.
- Anoxic conditions will develop in the subsurface if

 (1) O₂ respiring micro/macro organisms are present,
 (2) sufficient organic matter is present,
 (3) water infiltrates more slowly, and
 (4) the soil stays wet.
- Differences in mean soil solid OC contents between the two basins are not statistically significant (p > 0.5)
- At the HT basin, sharp decreases in soil water DOC in the upper 1.3 m of soil with further decreases to less than 1 mg/L in groundwater suggest that O₂ is replenished more quickly than it can be reduced by organic matter oxidation



SURFACE/SUBSURFACE O₂ EXCHANGE

O₂ diffusion in soil depends on porosity and moisture content

 $D_{g,i}^{soil} = \frac{\phi_g^2}{\star^{2/3}} D_{g,i}^{air}$

 $D_{g,i}^{soil}$ is the diffusion coefficient of gas *i* though soil (cm² d⁻¹), $D_{g,i}^{air}$ is the diffusion

coefficient of gas *i* through air (cm² d⁻¹), ϕ_g is the total volumetric gas-phase content (cm cm⁻¹),

and ϕ is the volume fraction of soil pores (porosity) (cm cm⁻¹). Because $\phi_g = \phi - \phi_w$, where ϕ_w is

the volumetric moisture content (cm cm^{-1}), the gas transport abilities of a soil decrease



SOIL TEXTURE & O₂ EXCHANGE

- Median silt+clay content in upper 1.6 m of soil is 41% at the SO basin and 2% at HT basin
- Textural differences contributed to large differences in the soil moisture retention curves
- Median volumetric gas-phase contents were 0.04 beneath the SO basin and 0.19 beneath the HT basin at a 0.3-m depth



- The narrow pores of a fine-texture soil (1) increase frictional resistance to water flow causing lower saturated hydraulic conductivity values; and (2) remain wet for extended periods because of capillary wicking and adhesion of soil water in the narrow pores
- O₂ exchange inhibited at SO basin but not at HT basin → different redox conditions
- Anoxic conditions led to denitrification and DOC serving as electron donor for progression of biogeochemical processes at the SO basin. Aerobic conditions led to NO₃⁻ leaching and DOC depletion at HT basin.

HYPOTHESIS #2

Variations in hydrologic conditions result in cyclic biogeochemical processes, switching N fate from NO₃⁻ leaching to reduction.

Bio Geochemical Information

 A temporal succession of biogeochemical processes was identified in shallow groundwater beneath the SO basin according to the following thermodynamically governed and microbially mediated succession of terminal electron accepting processes (TEAPs):

 $O_2 > NO_3^- > Mn(IV) > Fe(III) > SO_4^2^- > CO_2$

- Hydroclimatic conditions (rainfall and basin flooding) affected timing of biogeochemical processes.
- Cyclic denitrification resulted



STORMWATER QUALITY South Oak basin

- N primarily in organic form
- Typically aerobic
- Substantial amount of organic C
- Particulate/colloidal fractions significant at times



GROUNDWATER QUALITY South Oak basin

- N primarily in organic form when O₂ low and NO₃⁻ form when aerobic
- Typically low O₂ or anoxic
- GW DOC ~¹/₂ of SW DOC
- Particulate/colloidal fractions insignificant
- Cyclic variations in redox sensitive constituents: O₂, NO₃⁻, Mn²⁺ & Fe²⁺ (not shown), SO₄²⁻, CH₄ (not shown), & alkalinity
- GW CI similar to SW CI suggests reaction-dominated transport of N



BIOGEOCHEMICAL PROCESSES South Oak basin

- For each TEAP, reduction half-reaction transfers electrons: O₂ (4), NO₃⁻ (5), Mn⁴⁺ (2), Fe³⁺ (1), SO₄²⁻ (8), & DIC (4)
- Compute electron acceptor (EA) electron (e-) equivalents = (#e-) * (mM)
- DIC e- gains >> e- losses indicates carbonate interaction
- DOC e- losses > EA e- gains indicates plenty of DOC likely available to support heterotrophic processes



BIOGEOCHEMICAL PROCESSES South Oak basin

- CH₄ increases during prolonged flooding indicates highly reducing conditions and methanogenesis
- N₂ produced by denitrification (excess N₂) present during flooded periods
- CO₂ produced by organic C oxidation; organic C likely the predominant electron donor



DENITRIFICATION South Oak basin

- Excess N₂ concentrations as high as 3 mg/L
- Isotopically heavy δ¹⁵N and δ¹⁸O of nitrate (up to 25 and 15‰, respectively)
- June 2008 samples collected 2 days after infiltration suggests little denitrification at 0.5 m, but possibly some at 0.9 and 1.4 m
- July 2008 samples indicate greater isotopic enrichment 29 days after flooding – more time for denitrification



BIOGEOCHEMICAL CYCLING AND NITROGEN FATE

- Cyclic biogeochemical processes occur at different time scales: $O_2 \& NO_3^-$ ($\leq 1 \mod h$), Mn & Fe (seasonal), SO_4^{2-} (2–5 months), CH₄ (seasonal)
- The progression of biogeochemical conditions to Mn reduction and to more highly reductive processes provides strong evidence that NO₃⁻, when present, would be reduced by denitrification.
- Therefore, the periodic introduction of additional NO₃⁻ electrons from infiltration of oxygenated stormwater redirected the flow of electrons from the more highly reductive processes to denitrification.
- The substantial transfer of electrons supported by these more highly reductive processes, particularly SO₄²⁻ reduction, implies sufficient electron flow capacity is available to ensure denitrification would deplete NO₃⁻.

BIOGEOCHEMICAL PROCESSES Hunter's Trace

- Aerobic conditions (dissolved oxygen 5-8 mg/L) persisted beneath the HT basin, resulting in depletion of dissolved organic carbon (DOC) and NO₃⁻ leaching.
- Aerobic conditions precluded the reduction of other electron acceptors.
- Can we replicate the conditions at the SO basin at the HT basin?



HYPOTHESIS #3

Nutrient input into groundwater from stormwater basins can be reduced by retrofitting an infiltration basin with BAM that replicates natural biogeochemical processes.

Can Use BAM

- Integrated design effectively promotes nutrient reduction while maintaining stormwater volume control.
- Nutrient losses occurred in biosorption activated media (BAM) that produced conditions conducive to denitrification and phosphorus sorption.
- Denitrification was likely occurring intermittently in anoxic microsites in the unsaturated zone, which was enhanced by increased soil moisture within the BAM layer.

INFILTRATION Basin with BAM

- A retrofit to an existing basin was developed based on the natural biogeochemical processes identified at the existing stormwater basins using a "sub-basin" design:
- 1. Excavation of native soil in the bottom of a portion of an existing pond;
- Emplacement of a 0.3 m thick amended soil layer ("Biosorption Activated Media" mix): 1.0:1.9:4.1 mixture (by volume) of tire crumb (to increase sorption capacity), silt+clay (to increase soil moisture retention), and sand (to promote sufficient infiltration); and
- 3. Construction of a berm forming separate nutrient reduction and flood control basins.

HUNTER'S TRACE – Basin retrofit with BAM

- Reproduce soil conditions that exist at the SO basin by using an amended soil layer (BAM):
 - Increase soil moisture
 - Reduce oxygen transport
 - Increase sorption capacity
 - encourage denitifier growth





Basin with BAM – Model Calibration

 EIA (hectares)
 1.67

 Rainfall (mm)
 185

 Infiltration (mm/h)
 7.3

- Runoff/water-balance model: R×EIA – Infil. = ∆Storage
- Simulate August 2008 Tropical Storm Fay event.
- Good match to field data using realistic model parameters indicates model is suitable for design purposes.



Basin with BAM – Design Simulation

- Embed 100-yr (280 mm) 24-hr storm event in 2 years of actual rainfall (2004-2005)
- Conservative nutrient reduction basin infiltration rate = 0.73 mm/h
- For more realistic 7.3 mm/h infiltration + no 100-yr storm treatment volume = 88%, peak stage = 16.3 m.



Basin with BAM Construction After placement of erosion control blanket on berm and 3.7 inch storm



Pollution Control Basin

Flood Control Basin

On-Site ~ Mixing Operation~

Basin with BAM HYDROLOGIC MONITORING

- Nutrient reduction basin (NR) basin has overflowed berm during 123,116, and 105 mm storms.
- NR basin holds ~80 mm storm.
- Infiltration rate ~8.6 mm/h → ~90 hours to drain full NR basin.
- Higher soil moisture content due to BAM and more frequent ponding in NR basin.



Basin with BAM – NITRATE

- ~ 70% reductions in nitrate from pre-construction (2007– 2009) to post-construction (2009–2010) median concentrations in soil water and at the water table.
- Nitrate decreases may be due to dilution, sorption, reduced nitrification, denitrification, or some combination of these processes



Basin with BAM- NO₃-/CI- Ratios

- Compare NO₃⁻ and Cl⁻ to determine dilution effects
- A positive NO₃⁻/Cl⁻ ratio slope indicates NO₃⁻ is decreasing slower or increasing faster than Cl⁻ due to nitrification, NO₃⁻ input increased relative to Cl⁻, or Cl⁻ input decreased relative to NO₃⁻
- A negative NO₃⁻/CI⁻ ratio slope indicates NO₃⁻ is increasing slower or decreasing faster than CI⁻, possibly due to reaction (for example, denitrification), NO₃⁻ input decreased relative to CI⁻, or CI⁻ input increased relative to NO₃⁻
- A zero NO₃⁻/Cl⁻ slope indicates NO₃⁻ and Cl⁻ are changing at the same rate due to dilution.



Basin with BAM– NO₃-/CI⁻ Ratios

- Deviations suggest reaction losses of NO₃⁻ or variations in NO₃⁻ input
- Positive percentages indicate NO₃⁻ gains and negative percentages indicate NO₃⁻ losses.



Basin with BAM– SOIL GAS

- Soil gas sampling conducted during post-BAM period (N₂, O₂, Ar, N₂O, CH₄
- N₂O > ambient atmospheric levels (~0.3 ppmv) suggest denitrification.
- CH₄ > ambient atmospheric levels (~1.7 ppmv) suggest methanogenesis.
- Anoxic microsites likely exist in the aerobic vadose zone



Basin with BAM– DENITRIFICATION

 Slight isotopic enrichments for NO₃⁻ and N₂ after BMP in well M-0506 (3.9 m deep)



Basin with BAM– C Cycling

Increasing alkalinity and decreasing δ¹³C of DIC suggests oxidation of organic matter to DIC.



Basin with BMP – Denitrifiers

 Real-time PCR data suggests BAM layer is conducive to the growth of denitrifiers that possess the nirK gene



Basin with BAM – PHOSPHORUS

- ~ 80% reductions in total dissolved phosphorus (TDP) from pre-construction (2007– 2009) to post-construction (2009–2010) median concentrations in soil water
- No change in TDP at water table.
- TDP decreases may be due to dilution, sorption, precipitation, microbial assimilation, or some combination of these processes
- ortho-P > 80% TDP, total P (unfiltered) is ~1–10x TDP



Basin with BAM-PO₄³⁻/Cl⁻ Ratios

- Deviations suggest reaction losses of PO₄^{3–} or variations in PO₄^{3–} input
- Positive percentages indicate PO₄³⁻ gains and negative percentages indicate PO₄³⁻ losses.



SOIL MOISTURE RETENTION

- Moisture content as controlled by texture may be the single most important functional characteristic of BAM, and the SMRC can be used to assess this characteristic.
- A silt+clay content of ~25% (by volume) in BAM probably represents the minimum value that is adequate for increasing the fraction of saturated pore space to promote anoxic microsites that may serve as hotspots for denitrification.



HYPOTHESIS #4

N budget and fluxes beneath stormwater basins can be quantified using a system dynamics modeling approach.

What Happened?

- System dynamics modeling is an effective tool for modeling the N cycle.
- BAM contributed to removal of about onethird of the N mass inflow.
- The new integrated design using the functionalized soil amendment BAM is a promising passive, economical, stormwater nutrient-treatment technology.

APPROACH

- Use hydrologic data to compute water budget and fluxes and N loading
 - compute surface infiltration rate
 - compute surface infiltration N loading
 - compute subsurface rates
- Use water chemistry and system dynamics model to compute N budget and fluxes
 - calibrate and validate using field data
 - simulate N budget and fluxes

SURFACE INFILTRATION

- Use the runoff/water-balance model and calibrate to observed field conditions 2007–2010
- Matched observed stage well
- Use simulated infiltration volumes



SURFACE NITROGEN LOADING

 Use water-volume and N-mass balances to compute N concentration in ponded water (C_p) and N mass loading in surface infiltration (W_{out})



SUBSURFACE FLUXES

 Compute subsurface fluxes using 1-D continuity equation and field-measured volumetric water contents



SYSTEM DYNAMICS MODEL

- 1-D vertical, 4 layers
- Only water phase (gas and solid phases not modeled)
- Model layers approximate field conditions, e.g. BAM layer and locations of instrumentation



CONCEPTUAL MODEL

Simulate advective inflow/outflow, fixation, ammonification, nitrification, denitrification, and plant uptake



CALIBRATION & VALIDATION

- Calibrate model for period 1–15 December 2009
- Validate model for period 2 March 7 April 2010



NITROGEN FLUXES

- Temporal variability in N removal by denitrification was slight
- But denitrification consistently increased during the periods following large storm events
- Denitrification coincides with increased soil moisture.



NITROGEN Model BUDGET

- Leaching (advective outflow from layer 4) was the primary mechanism for N mass loss
- Denitrification losses are about one-third of the total N inflow

| Budget | Total nitrogen, g | | |
|-----------------------------|-------------------|------------|--|
| Component | Calibration | Validation | |
| Storage, initial | 1,016 | 839 | |
| Runoff (infiltration) | 277 | 1,696 | |
| Fixation | 167 | 412 | |
| Uptake | 23 | 57 | |
| Denitrification | 221 | 837 | |
| Leaching (out layer 4) | 346 | 1,296 | |
| Storage, final | 836 | 679 | |
| In – Out – Δ Storage | 34 | 78 | |

CONCLUSIONS

- 1. Fine-textured soil controls surface/subsurface oxygen exchange by maintaining elevated moisture content, thereby controlling biogeochemical processes and N and C cycling.
- 2. Variations in hydroclimatic conditions result in cyclic biogeochemical processes leading to cyclic denitrification.
- 3. Retrofitting of an infiltration basin using BAM resulted in decreased nitrate concentrations, which is partly due to intermittent denitrification, and decreased phosphorus, which is likely due to sorption.
- 4. A BAM mixture can be used to remove nutrients. Soil moisture content is important to maintain.
- 5. About 70 % reduction in nitrate, and about 80% reduction in phosphorus was obtained at the Hunter's Trace Retrofit stormwater basin.
- 6. System dynamics modeling can provide quantitative estimates of N budget and fluxes, which indicated that in the stormwater basin with BAM, denitrification accounted for a loss of about one-third of the total nitrogen mass inflow and was occurring predominantly in the BAM layer..

PUBLICATIONS Used

- 1. O'Reilly, et.al. 2011. "Soil Property Control of Biogeochemical Processes beneath Two Subtropical Stormwater Infiltration Basins, 2012." *Journal of Environmental Quality 41(2), 564–581—*
- 2. O'Reilly, et. al. 2011. "Cyclic Biogeochemical Processes and Nitrogen Fate beneath a Subtropical Stormwater Infiltration Basin," *Journal of Contaminant Hydrology*—
- 3. O'Reilly, et. al. 2012. "Nutrient Removal Using Biosorption Activated Media: Preliminary Biogeochemical Assessment of an Innovative Stormwater Infiltration Basin," *Science of the Total Environment* —
- 4. O'Reilly, et.al. 2012. "System Dynamics Modeling for Nitrogen Removal through Biosorption Activated Media in a Stormwater Infiltration Basin," *Science of the Total Environment* —
- 5. Wanielista, et.al. 2011. Nitrogen Transformation beneath Stormwater Retention Basins in Karst Areas. FDEP S0316, Tallahassee.
- 6. Wanielista, et.al. 2013. Stormwater Harvesting Using Retention and In-Line Pipes for Treatment Consistent with the new Statewide Stormwater Rule. FDOT BDK78 977-02, Tallahassee.

THE EFFECTIVENESS OF BIOSORPTION ACTIVATED MEDIA (BAM) TO REDUCE NITRATE AND ORTHOPHOSPHATE IN STORMWATER RUNOFF

PART 2: Science, Engineering and Application

Questions and Comments www.stormwater.ucf.edu Marty Wanielista, 2013



